

Council Meeting Minutes

October 18, 2022

8:30am

Zoom

Members Attending (alphabetical by last name):

Jeff Charbonneau, Ruben Flores, Evangelina Galvan Shreeve, Sativah Jones, Chris Reykdal, Mustapha Samateh, Davon Thomas, and Jeff Vincent.

Staff Attending (alphabetical by last name):

Amy Buck, Abby Chien, Lindsay Cunningham, KC Deane, Crystal Hall, Heather Hudson, Isaac Kwakye, Emma Lacalli, Kara Larson, Ami Magisos, Michael Meotti, Abbey Roth, Rathi Sudhakara, Katie Tallman, Becky Thompson, Marc Webster, and Christina Winstead.

Meeting called to order at 8:32am

Consent Agenda

Motion made to approve the Consent Agenda as presented.

Motion seconded.

Motion carried.

Approval of the Minutes

Motion made to approve the August Council Meeting Minutes.

Motion seconded.

Motion carried.

Executive Director Update

Presenter: Michael Meotti

Materials: [Complete College America](#) & [Tri-Cities Regional Insights](#)

- Over the next year, WSAC will determine a set of high-level key indicators that align to our cluster areas: affordability, enrollment, completion, and student supports, with equity crosscutting each one of the indicators. With the struggle of disparities with racial and ethnic gaps, that is a key agency priority.
- The regional profile includes a snapshot of enrollment by race and ethnicity in institutions in the Tri-Cities. The one segment of the population in the U.S. that has grown is the Latino/Latina population; the profile shows Hispanic enrollment at Columbia Basin College of 41% and at WSU Tri-Cities of 42%, whereas in the state it is at 15%.

Community Leaders Panel: Insights on Postsecondary Student Success

Facilitator: Abby Chien

Panelists: Cinthia Alvarez, Tri Cities Latino Community Network

Melanie Casciato, Columbia Basin College

Adán Mendoza, Student

Brian Moreno, Local Business Leader

Amandalyn Rubio, Pasco High School

Materials: [Tri-Cities Regional Insights](#)

Discussion: This panel is a conversation to highlight that there is no single story of what a postsecondary journey looks like. Questions are invited for the panelists.

- What are the realities for Tri-Cities residents in their efforts to pursue a postsecondary credential? Are there specific barriers or opportunities that exist for increasing persistence or completion?
 - There is no magic bullet, or one barrier, one gap that we need to close that's going to fix this problem. That means we need very well-articulated ideas about what credentials are and how that translates to opportunity, building a robust system. We need to also make sure that learners have clarity around how to navigate that system.
 - Pasco High School is an urban school serving 2,400 students; 83% of students are Hispanic and 33% are English language learners. All materials go out to the student body in English and Spanish. Meeting them where they are is the big thing.
 - The focus is really on how do we help students pay for college? How do we create a college-going culture in our community? There are students that do not even see college on their future goals and there are students that feel the need and the expectation to leave and go to college.
 - When we talk about creating a college-going culture, we are talking about that population of students that maybe do not see themselves as prepared for college, capable of college, smart enough for college, or supported enough to understand what college means. High school students have so many barriers to feeling like they belong and persevere into postsecondary education. It's vital to have that casual conversation with a student in a high school to set that tone and let them know the training opportunities that are available. To summarize, it's missed opportunities helping those students that don't see college as their pathway, and then really embracing the opportunities that exist in our community.
 - Think about the students in limbo, who don't have their status. They're not even asylum seekers, and refugees are not considered documented. Students are coming in with trauma and concern. How can we better serve them? It's not just about the act of attaining a meaningful credential or degree, but it is those pieces of who we are and our lived experience that follows us throughout our career.
 - For some the real problem is not believing in oneself. It's important that students go into a classroom and see others who look like them. How can we alleviate some of these personal pressures that students have? Sometimes it's easier to just keep working for that promotion instead of going to college, rolling the dice on how your life will turn out.
- Can you talk a little bit about how P Tech came about and what was the need in the Tri-Cities in particularly the strength of community? Where did the need come from and what was the response?
 - P Tech was created by IBM about twelve years ago. They had a workforce that was all about to retire. They could fix multiple problems by creating this three-legged stool between K-12 in communities that were underrepresented, bring in strong major partners to put together this industry-recognized credential, but also leave it open for the students.
 - There are now over 500 schools with employer partners working on this pathway. In the Tri-Cities, it's between the Pasco school district at their New Horizons Campus and shared jointly on the Columbia Basin College (CBC) campus. The industry partners are the Pacific Northwest National Laboratory and for Mission Integrated Solutions, and the LIGO gravitational Wave Observatory.

- What were some of the decision points that you personally think of when navigating postsecondary?
 - What helped were the teachers and resources provided. Earning college credit while in high school. Many students struggle with mental health issues—progress has been made, but more can be done.
- From high school to postsecondary to in the community, what are the types of skills that local business leaders are looking for? What are the types of ideas that students have about what their role might be in the community after graduation?
 - What is missing is the plug-and-play system. The market has to change. What is the right system? Is it inventory or available jobs? Or is it really looking at portable skill sets? You don't need to teach knife skills or math or accounting standards. Industry will pick up those pieces, but they need somebody who understands their self-worth and how they show up, their personality, what they contribute, and what they are passionate about.
 - Almost 45% of individuals in our community need to complete high school and look at postsecondary. We're struggling to fill demand in the community for employment. We have to continue to invest and keep our high schoolers on track. Not everyone has to go to college for four years; associate degrees are a starting point.
 - All of the panelists connected with someone who was by their side, supporting their goals. Talk to students about national career clusters and expose them to their interests.

Conclusion: The needs of the community are intersectional, and they are not separate from educational needs. It's natural as educators and policy makers to apply critical lenses, but we need to normalize that there are multiple pathways. How do we normalize multiple pathways at a systemic level?

Comments, observations, and questions included:

- Mentorship is crucial for students to know that one person and have them to go to when they are struggling.
- More mental health infrastructure and education is needed. CBC is working to acknowledge a student as a whole student. There are professional mental health counseling staff to work with students to help them and connect them with community resources.
- Adults in high schools can check on students who appear to be struggling or acting up to see if there is an underlying issue they are dealing with. Being a friend and providing that support will help them be more successful and potentially transition to postsecondary. Even just posing the question of how they're doing is a step forward.

Discussion: Completion & Workforce

Facilitator: Heather Hudson

Material: [Discussion Guide](#), [Washington's Transfer Ecosystem](#), [Adult Learner Study](#), & [Career Connect Tech](#)

Overview: Four years ago, the Council adopted the Strategic Action Plan, which yielded the strategic clusters of affordability, enrollment, completion, and student support, with equity at the center. The summary of the action plan is where we think the state is in those areas. The completion and student support areas are newer areas. How do we build out and recognize what is a state policy on completion? What is the state's commitment and investment of policy of increasing the rate of student success?

Comments, observations, and questions included:

- What does postsecondary success look like for students? What do the postsecondary and career pathways look like for students who are also trying to work or raise a family?
 - Student success looks different for every person and is unique.
 - Creating a landscape that allows students to go on their own pathway or lattice approach, instead of the historical linear approach is key.
 - With a system set up as a linear approach, how do we get this changed? For example, the earner/learner strategies.
 - How do we integrate our student services to meet the students where they are?
 - There is a misalignment around how we talk about what the students need and what the culture of higher education institutions is. Until we address the needs our students are coming into the system with, we are going to continue to see the current outcomes.

- How long should it take a student to get a form of credential?
 - Financial aid requirements dictate that: you have to get it done in this amount of time or you won't have the money. There are a lot of higher education framework that is already set. If you are a parent or full-time worker, it is unachievable because there is no money.
 - Some students can't graduate in four years without taking summer courses. The increase of state funding for summer courses is needed.
 - Crossing the stage to get the high school diploma is a moment in success but not the definition of success. Students have their own definition of success, including what you can do with it afterwards.
 - How do we guide students to ensure they have flexible academic plans? Need to recognize students need to get a degree but also need to take care of themselves.
 - We often develop metrics for postsecondary success for states, employers, or communities but not necessarily for students. Start with helping folks understand that this is about choosing a freedom for their lives. Freedom of choice of career, who they interact with, what they want to do or be is what we need to focus on—not set it up to be based on an economic variable.
 - Funding in Washington is predicated on institutions enrolling and retaining students, which can be agnostic to the experience of those students. If we want to be innovative, what's the Council's appetite to pursue a policy package between WSAC, SBCTC, COP, and OSPI, that incentivizes ownership of solutions vs students? For example, a funding vehicle to build out shared student success supports that leverage regional partnerships.
 - The vast majority of people pick a postsecondary program where they live, work and went to school. It's a place-based approach.
 - There is a lot of work to do in funding dual credit and identifying the best model.
 - Creating a Higher Education Recruitment and Retention taskforce that is not associated with any university, a non-biased group, to understand and see what the student needs.
 - Who has the best solution to meet the students and sustain it to scale?
 - What is there were some more opportunities for students in middle school to learn about the jobs that do exist?
 - How do we better help kids find what they are passionate about in middle school and high school? If we leveraged the high school and beyond plan in middle schools, you wouldn't be able to stop those students. Where students did a practice essay and practice FAFSA in junior year, college was a known fact and culture where they grew up. Early outreach is key.

- Washington just joined Complete College America. This is a big deal for Washington. We are trying to determine what are the ways we will determine student success.
 - The percentage of students that has a degree or credential is not the final mark of success, but it is an intermediate mark of success. Think about not just who our students are out of middle school or high school, but also who the students are that are coming back. What are the ways or things people have done in their lives, that we can give them credit for? How do we mentor students through the complicated systems we have or is there a way we can make them less complicated? Students need purpose whether it's a sixth grader or 45-year-old mom. Are there ways to eliminate barriers, as opposed to building bridges over barriers?
- What are the key measures for completion indicators? After you get the credential, what does that look like for students and how do we measure that success?
 - How are we defining persistence rate? For example, a 3.6 GPA at a rural high school is very different from a 3.6 at a top high school.
 - Persistence rate in the visualization is defined as: The percentage of students who continued enrollment at any institution in the second year after high school graduation. This is from ERDC's High School Graduate Outcomes dashboard.
 - As a state, we don't have a definition of an indicator that we are using. You want to be able to track across institutions. These are available data points for potential key indicators that we have adopted along the way.
 - How many of these students in a reasonable length of time are going to be pursuing postsecondary education and not just K-12?
 - If we could measure freedom, that's the right metric. Life fulfilling and life economically sustaining outcomes are tricky, but looking at enrollment, attainment, persistence, and completion and then by demographic to make sure we're reaching the full demographic in K-12. To get there the key is along the way they see agency and purpose in their own life by letting them explore their interests as much and as soon as possible. The teacher is a key point. You measure that in the community and by people not suffering in poverty. This is a moment to break down barriers and support people.
 - Is there data on people who dropped out of a major because they were forced out?
 - Who is gaining access to the high demand majors and are they serving Washington-originating students or are they having to accept out-of-state or out-of-country students who were able to access amazing high schools that were able to set them up beforehand?
 - We need a community-based indicator and to care about transferring the burden of success to an individual's shoulders.

Conclusion: We must figure out what the value proposition is of getting a credential and how they may stack on one another. As a Council and agency, we need to figure this out. We talk about credentials, but we need to define it. We are at a real moment in time, we need to be bold.

Public Comment

- Higher education is the last funding option for the state. Continue to not let the state forget when they defunded education. It's \$5,700 to go to Columbia Basin College. The elephant in the room is funding to make college affordable and accessible for all.

Meeting Adjourned: 12:01pm

Appendix ATVW meeting recording**Appendix B**

00:54:59 Amy Buck (she/her pronouns), WSAC Staff:
Welcome. Please use the chat feature to introduce yourself.

00:55:10 Amy Buck (she/her pronouns), WSAC Staff:
My name is Amy Buck (she/her pronouns), WSAC Staff

00:55:20 Ami Magisos:
Hello, Ami Magisos (she/her) WSAC Policy and Planning

00:55:48 Dr. Gregory King:
Gregory King WA MESA

00:55:51 Maryann Brathwaite:
Maryann Brathwaite, NWCCF

00:55:56 Kara Larson:
Hi all - Kara Larson (she/her), WSAC Research team

00:56:03 Katie Tallman:
Good morning, Katie Tallman (she/her), WSAC staff

00:56:15 Ed Lazowska:
Ed Lazowska (he/him), University of Washington Paul G. Allen School of CSE

00:56:46 Christi Harter:
Christi Harter, Greater Spokane Inc. VP Education & Talent; Executive Director Career Connect Northeast

00:56:49 Deidre Holmberg (She/Her/Ella):
Greetings, all! Deidre Holmberg (She/Her) from Amazon Web Services (previously STEMCore Consulting)

00:57:06 Emma Lacalli (she/her):
Emma Lacalli, she/her, WSAC research

00:57:11 Megan Filippello, LA to Rep. Slatter:
Hello all - Megan Filippello, Legislative Assistant to Representative Vandana Slatter

00:57:24 Michael Lee:
Michael Lee (he/him), Columbia Basin College

00:57:52 Amy Buck (she/her pronouns), WSAC Staff:
Meeting materials are located online here: <https://wsac.wa.gov/2022-meetings#october-18>

00:58:25 Christi Harter:
Could you please turn up the mic for Jeff Vincent? It is really hard to hear him. Thank you.

00:58:28 Celeste Monahan:
Hello - Celeste Monahan, Assistant Director of Fraud Prevention and Labor Standards Division at the Department of Labor & Industries, I am here for Director Joel Sacks.

00:58:38 Crystal Hall (she/her):
Crystal Hall (she/her) WSAC staff

00:59:32 Kara Larson:
I second what Christi said - it's difficult to hear Jeff V.

01:08:42 Crystal Hall (she/her):
Welcome to those joining us! Please utilize the chat feature to introduce yourself if you haven't already done so. Thank you!

- 01:08:59 Crystal Hall (she/her):
so*
- 01:10:17 Salvador Salazar:
Salvador Salazar | Office of Governor Jay Inslee
- 01:10:30 Erica Beckstrom:
Erica Beckstrom (she/her) FIRST Washington Robotics
- 01:10:37 Kevin Wang:
Kevin Wang, Mentors in Tech
- 01:10:59 Jolenta Coleman-Bush:
Jolenta Coleman-Bush, Microsoft Philanthropies
- 01:11:00 KC Deane (she/her):
KC Deane, she/her, WSAC Research
- 01:11:01 Damion Garza:
Damion Garza - SCW TRIO-Educational Opportunity Centers
- 01:11:23 John Kennedy:
John Kennedy, Benton-Franklin Council of Governments, jkennedy@bfcog.us
- 01:11:24 Rathi Sudhakara (she/her):
Rathi Sudhakara, Washington Student Achievement Council
- 01:12:14 Abbey Roth (she/her):
Abbey Roth, she/her, Washington Student Achievement Council
- 01:13:32 Amy Buck (she/her pronouns), WSAC Staff:
College Completion America: <https://wsac.wa.gov/sites/default/files/2022-10-18-0141-CCA.pdf>
- 01:18:35 Amy Buck (she/her pronouns), WSAC Staff:
Tri-Cities Regional Insights: <https://wsac.wa.gov/sites/default/files/2022-10-18-0241-Tri-Cities-Regional-Profile.pdf>
- 01:32:57 Amy Buck (she/her pronouns), WSAC Staff:
Discussion Guide: <https://wsac.wa.gov/sites/default/files/2022-10-18-0341-Discussion-Guide.pdf>
- 01:34:33 Crystal Hall (she/her):
If/when you would like to ask a question please raise your hand and I will call on you.
Thank you!
- 01:47:30 Amy Buck (she/her pronouns), WSAC Staff:
Career Connect Tech: <https://wsac.wa.gov/sites/default/files/2022-10-18-0344-Career-Connect-Tech.pdf>
- 02:17:38 Christi Harter:
Crystal, is it ok to ask a question now? I am wondering how the panelists feel about how a mentor could support them to and through high school to postsecondary.
- 02:20:09 Crystal Hall (she/her):
Yes, thank you Christi.
- 02:23:13 Christi Harter:
If there is not time for questions, I can reach out to the panelists later. Thank you, Crystal.
- 02:46:27 Crystal Hall (she/her):
We're on a short break and will continue at 10:30. Thank you!
- 02:59:35 Lindsay Cunningham (she/her):

- The Discussion Guide is located online here:
<https://wsac.wa.gov/sites/default/files/2022-10-18-0341-Discussion-Guide.pdf>
- 03:01:04 Kara Larson:
It sounds like Heather doesn't have a mic? Difficult to hear her.
- 03:02:38 Christina Winstead (she/her) WSAC:
Yes
- 03:02:49 Juliet Schindler:
much better, Heather!
- 03:15:41 Brian Moreno:
Question for the council - Funding in Washington is predicated on who owns the student. The incentive for institutions is to enroll and retain students which can be agnostic to the experience of those students. If we want to be innovative, what's the council's appetite to pursue a policy package between WSAC, SBCTC, and OSPI, that incentivizes ownership of solutions vs students? IE - a funding vehicle to build out shared student success supports that leverage regional partnerships.
- 03:24:12 Christi Harter:
Great idea with FAFSA being completed in Junior year!
- 03:25:03 Julie Garver:
@Brian - We would want to also include the public baccalaureate sector. As the entities listed SBCTC, WSAC and OSPI are not reflected
- 03:37:29 Gregory King:
Brian, can you clarify what do you mean by who owns the student?
- 03:53:28 Kara Larson:
Persistence rate in the visualization is defined as: The percentage of students who continued enrollment at any institution in the second year after high school graduation. This is from ERDC's High School Graduate Outcomes dashboard.
- 03:55:06 Kara Larson:
Link to ERDC's dashboard: <https://erdc.wa.gov/data-dashboards/high-school-graduate-outcomes>